DEEPENING VOICE AND VISIBILITY FOR WOMEN'S RIGHTS AND GENDER EQUALITY

2019, Gulmohar Auditorium, India Habitat Centre, New Delhi

18th November

A National Consultation organised by UN Women and Feminist Policy Collective

Background

This year is a critical moment for women's rights and gender equality movement globally. While, 2019 marked 40 years of CEDAW (Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women), 2020 marks the 25th anniversary of the adoption of the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action, and the 5-year milestone towards achieving the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). The Beijing Declaration was the introduction of 'gender mainstreaming' in public policy, and with it came the initiation of Gender-Responsive Budgeting (GRB) in India through the Ministry of Finance in 2004. With the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, the global community has also adopted the Addis Ababa Action Agenda which provides a roadmap for financing, including, transformative financing for gender equality.

Over the years, line Ministries in India with the Ministry of Women and Child Development (MWCD) as an anchor; have undertaken several gender mainstreaming and GRB efforts. The erstwhile Planning Commission had also set up a Working Group of Feminist Economists (WGFE). Much of the technical assistance to MWCD and the erstwhile Planning Commission was supported by UNIFEM (before 2010) and UN Women (post 2010). Significant gains were made to include intersectional and marginalized perspectives into the planning and budgeting processes at national and state level.

More recently, we have seen some measures from the government in relation to macroeconomic policy and financing, such as devolution of financial powers through the Fourteenth Finance Commission, support to decentralised planning through the Gram Panchayat Development Plans (GPDP), adoption of gender markers in the Expenditure Finance Committee (EFC), and indirect tax measures such as the Goods and Services Tax (GST).

However, there is very little on-going research and programming, that focuses on the gendered implications of the above-mentioned measures. The gender transformative impact of GRB initiatives has also not been systematically evaluated; it remains a bureaucratic exercise around filling and reporting of Statement 20 (Gender Budget Statement from budget 2006-07 to budget 2016-17), which in itself has a few technical gaps. Policy and programme design tend to take an instrumental approach and fail to factor in women's gendered constraints and women's human rights. Even today, women's voices in policy planning, programme design and monitoring remain largely absent or tokenistic in nature.

A stakeholder consultation for providing gender inputs to Budget (2020-21)

The Feminist Policy Collective in partnership with UN Women convened a Consultation in the context of the upcoming Union Budget plans for 2020-21. The National Consultation, 'Deepening Voice & Visibility for Women's Rights and Gender Equality' was held on 18 November, 2019 at the India Habitat Centre, New Delhi. Based on a situational analysis undertaken by the FPC, some thematic areas, strategies and mechanisms for GRB and financing were prioritized for discussions at the consultation: (a) women's economic empowerment, (b) strategies, tools and mechanisms for gender-responsive and intersectional planning, and, (c) accountability for GRB and financing.

The Consultation brought together government, policy makers, researchers and practitioners from across the country, working on GRB and feminist financing across sectors, to discuss and deliberate on persistent challenges at national and state level, as well as to identity promising practices that could be replicated and up scaled in the upcoming budget.

Report of the Consultation

Session 1: Transformative finance and gender-responsive budgeting (GRB): Setting the context

Chair: Jashodhara Dasgupta, Executive Director, National Foundation of India

The opening panel was chaired by **Jashodhara Dasgupta**, with **Jayati Ghosh**, Professor of Economics, Jawaharlal Nehru University; **Nishtha Satyam**, Deputy Representative, UN Women, India; **Aasha Kapur Mehta**, Visiting Professor, Institute for Human Development; and **Nilangi Sardeshpande**, Project Anchor, Society for Health Alternatives (SAHAJ) Pune. **Devaki Jain**, Member, Working Group of Feminist Economists & Founder, Institute of Social Studies Trust (ISST) provided key remarks.

Jashodhara Dasgupta provided an overview of the history of GRB in India, and the macro-economic context and links to the current international context of conventions and agreements. She further highlighted the need for going beyond gender budgeting and include transformative financing as an issue.

Nishtha Satyam highlighted the renewed interest of the government in gender responsive financing and budgeting, and the need to build upon this opportunity. She stressed that this window of opportunity could help influence a gender responsive lens to planning and transformative budgeting.

In addition, she suggested the need to leverage the growing interest of the private sector and their contributions to CSR (Corporate Social Responsibility) for gender equality initiatives.

Devaki Jain emphasised the need for feminists to move away from gender budgeting, given fundamental flaws in the macro-economic framework, including the budget. Rather, she urged the group to raise fundamental questions, such as, 'What should the macro-economic framework look like?' She also called for increased representation of women's voice in formulation of economic and social policies.

Aasha Kapur Mehta traced the major events in the feminist history of India that led to gender budgeting. The Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Women and Child Development and the Planning Commission played a key role in pushing for gender budgeting. UNIFEM (before 2010) and UN Women supported in engendering the Tenth, Eleventh and the Twelfth Five-year Plans and in building capacity of state governments.

She highlighted the fact that a decade's worth of research and evidence has been helpful in pointing out what had not worked for GRB. According to her, one of the key limitations of GRB, was that it had stayed limited to the Gender Budget Statement¹, and had not gone beyond this, to include a gender perspective in developing plans, programmes, financing and implementation processes. Aasha Kapur Mehta emphasized that the Approach to Gender Budgeting cannot be number crunching and mechanistic and instead the focus should be on using frameworks that make sense and that are based on understanding what are women's needs and priorities and addressing them. Simply creating Gender Budget Cells is not enough. Frequent transfers of officers prevent the knowledge gained from becoming a part of institutional memory. Among areas of improvement, she suggested the need for GBCs to use the frameworks and tools that had been outlined in the MWCD Handbook on Gender Budgeting, continuous capacity building, monitoring the work of the GBCs by creating a special task force on GRB as recommended in the 12th Plan and including women's voices in the planning and use of funds at all levels starting with the Gram Panchayat Development Plan to pave the way forward for a 'feminist financing architecture'.

Jayati Ghosh expressed her disappointment at the current state of affairs, in particular, the lack of reliable and valid government data, thereby making any analysis or budgeting meaningless. As a result, there was no option but to wait for the CAG (Comptroller and Auditor General of India) report, which itself comes with significant delays. She highlighted the grievous consequences of not

¹ The Gender Budget Statement was first introduced in Union Budget 2005-06 and was called Statement 19. From Budget 2006-07 to Budget 2016-17, it was called Statement 20. Since Budget 2017-18, it is called Statement 13.

knowing where the money was spent. For instance, she shared that the government spent 24% less than what was budgeted in the 2018-19 Budget.

While shedding light on the macro-economic situation in India, Jayati Ghosh turned her focus to the states, as most schemes are implemented at the state level. She pointed out that state governments were being starved of finances due to the increasing use of cess/ surcharges (controlled by the Centre) as the main tools for financing schemes. Amongst recent developments that impacted women, Jayati Ghosh singled out GST (Goods and Services Tax); a reform biased towards large capital that negatively impacted SHGs (Self Help Groups), small businesses and micro finance. Further, she brought to the fore how GST transfers had not been made to the states for the past 4 months that in turn affected finance flows to a range of programmes.

In addition, she urged feminist economists to look at budgeting asks in the context of the on-going economic crisis, indicated by the decline in consumption in rural areas and reduction in monetary wages over the past 4-5 months. She further emphasised, the need to advocate for increased public spending on MGNREGA (Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Act) and prioritisation of food provisions for those under the poverty line.

Nilangi Sardeshpande spoke about GRB in the context of Sustainable Development Goals. An important concern raised was that some crucial SDG goals had not been accepted for measurement; an example being Goal 17 (Partnerships for the goal). She also raised the issue of the lack of gender disaggregated data in the Indian SDG indicators. Nilangi Sardeshpande also pointed out the selective measurement of SDG indicators. In this regard, she emphasized the need to question the purported progress of the SDGs in India.

Session 2: Transforming policies for women's economic empowerment

Chair: Suneeta Dhar, Senior Advisor, JAGORI

The opening panel was chaired by **Suneeta Dhar**, and the panel included **Ritu Dewan**, Vice President, Indian Society of Labour Economics; **Sejal Dand**, Executive Director, Area Networking and Development Initiatives (ANANDI), and Dr. **Sona Mitra**, Principal Economist, The Initiative for What Works to Advance Women and Girls in the Economy (IWWAGE).

Suneeta provided the background context for the session by pointing out the lack of genderdisaggregated data and that backward and forward linkages in schemes were among the major lacuna in policies around women's empowerment and safety. At the same time, she stated that one

needs to keep the larger structures of inequalities in mind, beyond implementation of projects, which in turn undermined gender equality.

Ritu Dewan argued that there was a need to look beyond GBS (Gender Budget Statement) to fully realise the potential of GRB (Gender Responsive Budgeting). She also emphasised the need to look at structural issues that holds women back. This includes the need to look at the political economy of macro-economics, such as the impact of demonetisation, disinvestment and use of technology on women's employment and age of marriage. She also argued for the need to go beyond schemes and look at barriers affecting women's participation in the economy. For instance, government child care facilities such as *Anganwadis* are open only half a day, not keeping in mind the working day/ time schedules of working women that in turn is a barrier for women with children who want to enter the job market.

The persistence of sexist beliefs also affects women's access to schemes. For instance, till date, women are not recognised as farmers, and therefore, ineligible for schemes. In addition, women working in agriculture are subject to human rights violations such as forced hysterectomies and wage cuts for taking a day off. Additional hurdles come in the form of household chores whose sole responsibility falls on the women. The portrayal of UJWALA scheme for women, further reinstates sexist beliefs around cooking being a woman's job alone. In addition, the scheme has not made their lives easier as it offers only the first cylinder free, but requires payment for refilling, which women are unable to afford.

Ritu Dewan also touched upon the issue of increasing unemployment, particularly among young, educated adults and its possible linkage with increased violence against women. In the context of safety, she also raised concerns over increasing disinvestment in public transport by the government accompanied by increasing dependence on private operators such as Uber. As the way forward, she emphasised the need for developing a Gender Equality Attainment Scale (for states), looking at GST with a gender lens and raising questions about the implications of labour codes on definition of work and workplace.

Sejal Dand's main arguments were around the need to focus on women's rights at work and their right to work. She stressed the importance of labour codes and social security provisions for women. As women are involved in varied jobs and tasks, one cannot have a scheme that leaves the duty of justifiability on employers. In addition, Sejal pointed out that there is displacement of women's labour due to machines, as also large scale dispossession from resources, wherein women's

marginalized social and economic position in society restricts their access to resources from commons and forests.

As a recommendation, she stressed upon the importance of increased funding to MNREGA, as it gave money directly into the hands of women, particularly for SC and ST women. In addition to employment through MNREGA, women's cooperatives must be encouraged and they need to be exempted from stamp duty, just as in the case of SHGs. Lastly, Sejal Dand raised the issue of raising salaries of frontline women workers such as ASHA and *Anganwadi* workers to legitimise their contributions.

Sona Mitra concurred with Ritu Dewan on the need to go beyond the sectorial budgeting process under GRB, and to raise questions about the budget providing opportunities to women, particularly in declining female labour force participation. She also presented a framework to analyse factors affecting women entrepreneurship. In her view, women entrepreneurs need easy access to credit, market and technology. The smart phone revolution has increased access to technology, but more for men than women. In terms of credit, the government has provided MUDRA loans, but these are not large enough to make women's businesses sustainable.

In addition, she stressed upon the fact that collective actions of women were more efficient than that of a single entrepreneur, and in that context, recommended the prioritisation of women's economic collectives over SHGs. On building capacities around skilling (with programmes like Deen Dayal Upadhyaya Grameen Kaushalya Yojna and Pradhan Mantri Kaushal Vikas Yojna), studies have shown that there is a low uptake of girls for such programmes. She argued that safety concerns of parents and lack of support for migration to those offered employment outside their homes were among the causes for the above. Sona Mitra also raised concerns on skilling continuing to be in the traditional domains associated with women such as tailoring and working in beauty parlours.

Session 3: Strategies, tools & mechanisms for inclusion of marginal voices in feminist policy-making & financing: Challenges and opportunities

Chair: Subhalakshmi Nandi, Director (Policy), International Centre for Research on Women (ICRW)

The opening panel was chaired by **Subhalakshmi Nandi**, and the panel included **Beena Pallical**, General Secretary, Dalit Arthik Adhikar Andolan, **Hilda Grace**, President, Centre for Rural Studies and Development, **Pooja Singh**, Gender Budgeting Consultant, UN Women India MCO, **Dharmishtha Chauhan**, Independent Consultant, **Poonam Kathuria**, Founder-Director, Society for Women's Action and Training Initiatives (SWATI), **Sanya Seth**, Programme Analyst (Intergovernmental Processes and

Women, Peace & Security), UN Women India MCO and **Subrat Das (Discussant)**, Executive Director, Centre for Budgeting and Governance Accountability (CBGA).

Subhalakshmi Nandi set the context on the need to include marginal voices in feminist policy making and exploring challenges that were hindering such inclusion and the need to explore potential opportunities.

Beena Pallical stressed the need to expand the feminist lens by adding Dalit, Adivasi and other marginalised perspectives to it. She also pointed out the need for convergence across schemes, particularly in the context of targeted budgeting. While India has target budgeting in the form of tribal sub-plan and special component plan, gender as a component is missing in these plans. This is an area that Beena Pallical emphasised should be an ask of the upcoming budget. Lastly, she proposed that FPC attach itself to two schemes (scholarships for Dalit girls and entrepreneurship for Dalit women) in terms of policy advocacy and reviewing implementation, in sectors such as agriculture and horticulture.

Hilda Grace shared her experience on advocacy with the state government around gender budgeting. She pointed out that her organisation organised a pre-budget consultation involving government representatives, where the issue of low allocations to women was emphasised. This resulted in increased allocation for women but it was unclear if this had implications for increased spending as that is something, they have been unable to track so far. Another success that Hilda shared was ensuring the institution and implementation of an assistance scheme for Single (non-widowed) women in Andhra Pradesh. Other best practices included empowering women to monitor NREGS, involving them in formulating district budgets and creating Mahila Mandal Sabhas to include women in the GPDP process as well. Lastly, she flagged the need for a technical group to hand-hold organisations in states and provide them support in achieving state-specific GRB goals.

Pooja Singh spoke about Madhya Pradesh's experience of setting up the Inter-departmental Monitoring Committee for gender transformative policies and budgets. According to her, the committee is a reflection of structural improvement within government institutions. They undertake research as well a capacity building and sensitisation of officials. The recommendations of the committee have been acknowledged by various departments and have been a successful process. However, there have been challenges in changing the structure and approach to GBS which remains a reporting exercise. Lastly, Pooja Singh highlighted that the lack of funds at state level for gender budgeting remains a limitation.

Dharmishtha Chauhan singled out the GPDP as a strong entry point for strengthening the engendering process. She spoke about how it serves as a participatory planning exercise, and incorporates feedback and demand from the community. In this context, she talked about her study on whether the GPDP process was inclusive for women. The findings included that though, women were being mobilised and their demands heard, the process of actual allocations at the ward level did not reflect their priorities. Currently, states are trying to invite women in committees, conduct trainings on gender and increase spending on women. Dharmishtha added that while the quality of these tasks at the state level may be an issue, that is where CSOs (Civil Society Organisations) can step in and play an important role. To conclude, she pointed out that, with the government reaching out for technical expertise, CSOs must be prepared with solutions and not limit themselves to pointing out the problems alone.

Poonam Kathuria focused on the need for women to make their demands heard and emphasised the role of Mahila Gram Sabhas as an avenue for this. She stressed that Mahila Gram Sabhas put together issues from the safety audit in the form of demands and let women's voices be heard in the public.

Subrat Das summarised key learnings from the session: One, within the ambit of CSOs and two, within the ambit of the government. Drawing upon Beena's points, he spoke about how CSOs need to have a progressive, all-inclusive political stance. On the government end, Subrat emphasised the need to strengthen existing interventions, programmes and schemes. He went on to talk about identifying and utilising entry points for strengthening the voices of marginalised women in policies, programmes and budgets. Some of these entry points could be in the form of an outcome budget, pre-budget consultations, GRB, GPDP and use of Mahila Gram Sabha space.

He appreciated the Inter-Departmental Monitoring Committee (from MP), which on the one hand, does away with the question of whether ownership of GRB should lie with MWCD or MoF, on the other, it raises questions about instituting accountability mechanisms within the government apparatus. Another edge that the IDMC offered to GRB practices in other states was that it didn't see GBS as an end in itself. The creation of IDMC, he said, shows a major change but what needs to be done is to have a budget for gender budgeting.

As the way forward, he concurred with the need for CSOs to be ready with policy/programmatic solutions to key problems. Additionally, Subrat Das stressed the need to move beyond a gender-binary framework when thinking about Gender Budgeting and also include issues and interventions

relating to transgender persons. Lastly, there was a need to keep in mind that all policy targets may not be quantifiable and an excessive focus over quantifiable results would reinforce exclusion.

Session 4: Advancing gender-responsive planning and budgeting: Interactions with government representatives

Chair: Renu Khanna, Trustee, Society for Health Alternatives (SAHAJ)

The session was convened by **Renu Khanna**, Trustee, Society for Health Alternatives (SAHAJ), followed by an interaction with **Santosh**, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Women and Child Development.

The session began with **Renu Khanna** introducing Santosh, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Women and Child Development. As part of the introduction, Renu also mentioned that Santosh is in charge of the Gender Budget Cell.

Santosh began by giving a brief (full text available in Annexure-III) on the intent behind adoption of gender budgeting by the government of India. In this, she also pointed that India's gender budgeting efforts stand out globally because of their influence on expenditure as well as revenue policies.

This was followed by an interactive session with the participants.

Renu Khanna's question was in the context of SDGs. She wanted to know whether MWCD looked at budgeting for specific goals and whether they were looking at an integrated approach and the gender equality outcomes desired, that went beyond individual schemes.

Santosh responded by saying that MWCD is the nodal ministry for SDG-5 and they have developed national indicators to measure progress in consultation with MoSPI (Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation). She conceded that all schemes were not geared towards specific SDG targets, but at the same time, there were schemes such as *Beti Bachao Beti Padhao* and *Ujjwala* that are directly related to specific SDG indicators.

Dharmishtha Chauhan asked if under the Gender budgeting scheme, the government was planning to fund under the research component.

Santosh responded by stating that gender budgeting and research has been merged to form the Gender Budgeting Research Publication and Monitoring Scheme. Under the research component, MWCD can fund studies related to gender budgeting. She invited participants of the Consultation to send proposals for gender budgeting research studies.

Pragati Kalita brought up the concern of poor health and nutritional levels of women living in the **Char** areas and tea-gardens of Assam. She also pointed out the issue of high rates of adolescent pregnancy in Meghalaya and the lack of adequate health clinics to support them. Pragati also raised the concern of discussions around gender budgeting being restricted to only the male and female gender without considering the whole spectrum of gender identities. Lastly, she requested that the government provide transgender and non-binary people access to shelter homes which are currently not inclusive.

Ritu Dewan raised the issue of no spending for acid victims despite a budgetary allocation. The same situation prevails with regard to funds for victims of trafficking.

Santosh responded to the lack of budget allocation for centrally sponsored schemes by pointing out the lack of state contribution to these schemes and also the issue of under-utilisation by state governments of even the allocated amounts. She also stressed that state governments need to send proposals in order for the Centre to release the funds.

In the context of PMMVY (*Pradhan Mantri Matru Vandana Yojna*), **Sejal Dand** asked if the government was considering extension of the scheme beyond the first child.

Santosh responded by saying that the government was considering extending the scheme to two children.

Amit Kumar brought up the issues faced by sex workers, particularly with regard to SRHR (Sexual & Reproductive Health Rights) services and maternity benefits. He argued that benefits of such schemes did not reach till then because of the discrimination and stigma associated with the profession. In addition, he also spoke about the need to sensitise police personnel. Lastly, Amit emphasised the need to provide social security services for retired sex workers.

Santosh responded by saying that NACO (National AIDS Control Organisation), Ministry of Health and Ministry of Home were organising training for police personnel, which Amit countered that it was restricted to training around HIV rather than broader sensitization to reduce violence and stigma associated with it.

Conclusion

The consultation meeting witnessed active participation of all speakers and they appreciated the opportunity to dialogue with the Joint Secretary, Ministry of Women and Child Development. The participants shared their concerns and ideas with the hope to build collaborations with NITI Aayog

and other line ministries to advocate the Key Asks for the Union Budget 2020-21 from the Collective. The discussion touched upon all the themes of the Key Asks document collated by the members of the Collective. The document was sent in late December 2019 to Ministry of Women and Child Development and Ministry of Finance along with other ministries for future collaborations with FPC. The collaboration will serve the Collective to push the agenda for transformative financing through research and consultation activities. Feminist Policy Collective core members have initiated the work on post budget analysis to be shared with the relevant ministries in the coming months of 2020.

Annexure-I: Agenda of the Consultation

Time	Session	Speakers
9.00 am - 10.00 am		Registration and Tea
10.00 am – 11.45 am	Transformative financing and gender-responsive budgeting (GRB): Setting the context	Jashodhara Dasgupta (Chair) Executive Director, National Foundation of India (NFI)
		Jayati Ghosh
		Chairperson, Centre for Economic Studies and Planning,
		Jawaharlal Nehru University
		Nishtha Satyam
		Deputy Representative, UN Women India MCO
		Aasha Kapur Mehta
		Visiting Professor, Institute for Human Development
		Nilangi Sardeshpande
		Project Anchor, Society for Health Alternatives (SAHAJ)
		Devaki Jain (Special Address)
		Member, Working Group of Feminist Economists & Founder, Institute of Social Studies Trust (ISST)
11.45 am – 12 noon	Tea Break	
12 noon – 1.15 pm	Transforming policies for women's economic	Suneeta Dhar (Chair) Senior Advisor, JAGORI
	empowerment	Schol Advisor, JACON
		Ritu Dewan

		Vice President, Indian Society of Labour Economics
		Sona Mitra
		Principal Economist, The Initiative for What Works to Advance Women and Girls in the Economy (IWWAGE)
		Advance women and dins in the Economy (IWWAGE)
		Sejal Dand
		Executive Director, Area Networking and Development
		Initiatives (ANANDI)
1.15 pm – 2.00 pm		Lunch
1.15 pm – 2.00 pm		Lunch
2.00 pm – 3.15 pm	Strategies, tools & mechanisms	Subhalakshmi Nandi (Chair)
	for inclusion of marginal voices in feminist policy-making &	Director (Policy), International Centre for Research on
	financing: Challenges and	Women (ICRW), Asia Office
	opportunities	
	(Interventions from the floor)	Beena Pallical
		General Secretary, Dalit Arthik Adhikar Andolan
		Hilda Grace
		President, Centre for Rural Studies and Development
		Tresident, centre for hard stadies and bevelopment
		Pooja Singh
		Conday Budgeting Consultant UNIMomen
		Gender Budgeting Consultant, UN Women
		Dharmishtha Chauhan
		Independent Consultant
		Poonam Kathuria
		Founder-Director, Society for Women's Action and Training

		Initiatives (SWATI)
		Sanya Seth
		Due grant as Analyst / Integration and a Due access and
		Programme Analyst (Intergovernmental Processes and
		Women, Peace & Security), UN Women India MCO
		Subrat Das (Discussant)
		Executive Director, Centre for Budgeting and Governance
		Accountability (CBGA)
3.15 pm - 3.30 pm		Tea Break
3.30 pm – 4.45 pm	Advancing gender-responsive	Renu Khanna (Chair)
	planning and budgeting: Interactions with government	Trustee, Society for Health Alternatives (SAHAJ)
	representatives	
	representatives	
		Sanyukta Samaddar*
		Advisor, National Institute for Transforming India (NITI)
		Aayog
		Alok Kumar*
		Advisor, National Institute for Transforming India (NITI)
		Aayog
		Santosh
		Laint Conneton , Ministry of Wayson and Child Davidson and
		Joint Secretary, Ministry of Women and Child Development
		Anima Vachistha*
		Anjana Vashistha*
		Deputy Secretary, Department of Economic Affairs, Ministry
		of Finance
		Sunita Sanghi
		Senior Advisor, Ministry of Skill Development and
		Semon Advisor, withistry of skill bevelopilient and

		Entrepreneurship
		Alka Upadhyay*
		Additional Secretary, Ministry of Rural Development
		Meenakshi Gupta*
		Member Secretary, National Commission for Women
		*To Be Confirmed INVITED BUT DID NOT COME
4.45 pm - 5.00 pm	Closing remarks and next steps	UN Women India MCO & Representative of Feminist Policy Collective (FPC)

Annexure-II: List of Participants

S.			
No.	Name	Organisation	Email id
		Institute for Human	
1	Aasha Kapur Mehta	Development	aashaihd@gmail.com
		All India Network of Sex	
2	Amit Kumar	Workers	ak0496@gmail.com
3	Amita Pitre	Oxfam India	amita@oxfamindia.org
4	Ankit Vyas	Oxfam India	ankitkvyas@gmail.com
5	Ankita Bhat	UN Women - MWCD	ankita.bhat@unwomen.org
6	Anuradha Kapoor	Swayam	swayam@swayam.info
7	Atiya Anis	IWWAGE	atiya.anis@iwwage.org
8	Beena Pallical	Dalit Arthik Adhikar Andolan	beena@ncdhr.org.in
		Member, Working Group of	
		Feminist Economists &	
9	Devaki Jain	Founder, Institute of Social	devakijain@gmail.com
9		Studies Trust (ISST)	<u>devakijain@gmaii.com</u>
10	Dharmishtha Chauhan	Independent Consultant	dharmisthac@gmail.com
11	Drishti Rastogi	CBGA	drishti@cbgaindia.org
	Drisiiti Kastogi	CBGA	drishti@cogaindia.org
12	Fathayya Khan	National Foundation of India	fathayya@nfi.org.in
13	Geetika Hora	World Bank	gitika.hora@gmail.com
	Geetika Hora	World Balik	gitika.noru@ginan.com
		Centre for Rural Studies and	
14	Hilda Grace	Development	crsdorgatp@gmail.com
	Jashodhara		S. S
15		National Foundation of India	iashodhara@nfi.org.in
16	Jayati Ghosh	JNU	jayatijnu@gmail.com
	,		The second secon
17	Julie Thekkudan	Independent Consultant	juliethekkudan@gmail.com
		All India Network of Sex	
18	Kusum	Workers	ainsw.india@gmail.com
19	Monisha Behal	NEN	monishabehal@gmail.com
20	Nesar Ahmed	BARC	nesar@barcjaipur.org
	Nilangi	-	
21	Sardeshpande	SAHAJ	nilanginaren@gmail.com
22	Nilanjana Sengupta	ICRW	nilanjana.seng@gmail.com
23	Nishtha Satyam	UN Women	satyam.nishtha@unwomen.org
		Gender Budegting	
24	Pooja Singh	Consultant, UN Women	pooja.singh@unwomen.org

		Society for Women's Action	
25	Poonam Kathuria	and Training Initiatives (SWATI)	pkathuria.swati@gmail.com
		,	
26	Pragati Kalita	the Action Northeast Trust	pragati@theant.org
27	Praveena Anand	JAGORI	praveena@jagori.org
28	Priyambada Seal	FPC	priyambada.official@gmail.com
29	Priyanka Samy	IBP	samy.priyanka@gmail.com
30	Rajini Menon	Oxfam India	rajini@oxfamindia.org
31	Ravi Duggal	Anusandhan Trust	rduggal57@gmail.com
32	Renu Khanna	SAHAJ	renu.cmnhsa@gmail.com
33	Ritu Dewan	Indian Society of Labour Economics	dewan.ritu@gmail.com
34	Santosh	Joint Secretary, MWCD	santosh.1975@gov.in
35	Sanya Seth	UN Women	sanya.seth@unwomen.org
36	Sarah	National Foundation of India	sarah@nfi.org.in
37	Sejal Dand	ANANDI	sejaldand@gmail.com
38	Siddhi Mishra	MWCD	mwcdgenderbudgeting@gmail.com
39	Sona Mitra	IWWAGE	sona.mitra@iwwage.org
40	Subhalakshmi Nandi	ICRW	subhalakshmi.nandi@gmail.com
41	Subrat Das	CBGA	subrat@cbgaindia.org
42	Suneeta Dhar	JAGORI	suneeta.dhar@jagori.org
43	Uppali Mohanty	CYSD	uppali@cysd.org

Annexure III: Talking points of Ms Santosh (Joint Secretary, MWCD)

Talking Points for Joint Secretary for Consultation on Transformative Financing for Gender Equality

ABOUT THE SESSION

 The session will focus on sharing of experiences of the Central Government Ministries (NITI Aayog, MoSDE, DEA, MoRD and NCW). This will provide a platform for MWCD to highlight the work done thus far, achievements made, challenges faced and (good) practices from the ground after the adoption of GB in India.

II. TALKING POINTS/REFERENCE POINTS FOR THE SPEECH

a. Introduction

- GoI is committed to promoting gender equality in all areas of development through legislative mandates, Policy/Program Implementation and schematic Interventions, to address the vulnerabilities faced by women.
- 3. It was recognised that prioritizing financial resources for programmes/schemes for women is critical for their development.
- With this intent, GoI adopted Gender Budgeting in 2005-06 as a tool to prioritize government budgets towards women's empowerment and make budgets more gender sensitive.
- 5. GB is concerned with gender sensitive formulation of legislation, programmes and schemes; allocation of resources; implementation and execution; audit and impact assessment of programmes and schemes; and follow-up corrective action to address gender disparities.
- India's GB efforts stand out globally because we have not only influenced expenditure but also revenue policies(like differential rates for men and women in property tax rates and income tax rates)and have extended to state govt. levels.

b. Approach followed by MWCD

7. The Ministry of Women and Child Development adopted "Budgeting for Gender Equity" as a Mission Statement. Since then, as the nodal ministry

for GB, MWCD has been undertaking several initiatives for taking gender responsive planning and budgeting forward at the National and State and Local Levels. The Ministry has been following a three-pronged approach:

- Strengthening of gender budgeting structures in all Ministries/Departments (GB Cells, GB Statement etc)
- Internal and external capacity building on gender mainstreaming (Training Programmes organized through GB Scheme, engaged LBSNAA, NIFM,)
- ➤ Facilitating Gender Budget analysis of existing programmes, which would then feed into addressing gaps and strengthening service delivery mechanisms.

With our concerted efforts of advancing GB, we have achieved few milestone like:

- MWCD has been made permanent invitee to EFC meetings; thus Influence policies/schemes at the planning stage itself.
- Reconstitution of Gender Budget Cells and designation of Nodal officers in Ministries/Departments
- ➤ In Gender Budget Statement in 2019-20, 38 Ministries/Departments/UTs have reported Rs. 1, 36,934.10 Crore (4.9% of total budget). Magnitude of GB allocations vis-à-vis total budget has increased from 2.79% in 2005-06 (Rs. 14,378.68 Crore).
- Consultative meetings with MoPR were held in 2018 and 2019 to encourage enhanced investments on women in GPDPs. MoPR has included Gender Budgeting and women's sub plan (30% allocations for women) under the Revised GPDP Guidelines 2018.
- ➤ In the Budget Speech 2019-20, Hon'ble FM had highlighted gender analysis and Gender Budgeting. The Speech also proposed to form a broad-based Committee with Government and private stakeholders to evaluate and suggest action for moving forward on GB. I would like to

infom this august gathering that a Broad Based Committee for Gender Analysis and Budgeting has been constituted comprising of government and private stakeholders in this month only.

- ➤ For the first time MoF has engendered the Budget Circular by including gender paras. We have written to MoF and hold discussions which have resulted in the inclusion of a paragraph on Gender Budgeting in the Budget Circular 2020-21. Para 13.2 highlights the importance of GB in all schemes/departments. And Actual Expenditure for 2019-20 has also been included in the GB Statement
- "13.2 Statement No. 13 "Gender Budgeting" in Expenditure Profile. Gender Budgeting is a process of identifying gender specific barriers across all sectors of development. The process of budget planning and preparation provides a critical opportunity to identify, prioritize and address gender concerns in all Ministries/Departments. It may be noted here that addressing gender issues may require formulation of a specific scheme/programme for women and girls. However, Ministries/Departments may make existing schemes/programmes more gender responsive. It may be noted here that each and every sector and department has an impact on the lives of women and girls, and therefore, it is felt that schemes/programmes should have gender component. Therefore, to accompany the budget submissions for the Financial Year 2020-21, all Ministries/Departments are required to prepare and submit a Gender Budget Statement (Statement 13 in Expenditure Profile) in the prescribed format."
- Presenting specific GB inputs to the 15th Finance Commission MWCD has written to as well as made a presentation with a full slide on GB before the 15th Finance Commission, highlighting the need to incorporate concerns of women and girls into their future fiscal devolution formula used for allocation of funds.
- Consultations with key stakeholders (Central Ministries and gender experts) - This year, several consultations have been held with key Central Ministries, where we have highlighted the importance of recognizing the need for gender budgetary allocations.
- ➤ In June 2019, MWCD also conducted a brainstorming exercise with prominent gender experts in order to understand further entry points into GB.

- > MWCD has written to all Chief Secretaries to recognise gender as a budgetary priority; and to adopt gender budgeting. We have also requested States to designate a Nodal Officer for advancing GB, strengthening the training and capacity building process.
- As per the direction of PMO, in August 2019, an exercise was conducted to improve the quality of the current Gender Budget Statement and to include schemes that had a gender component but were not being included in the Statement. For this, a thorough analysis of the GB Statement and the schemes of GoI was conducted by MWCD and a detailed matrix was developed. Action from PMO is awaited in this regard.
- Organising/supporting GB trainings/Workshops Over the last 4 financial years, more than 7000 officials from the National as well as State level have been trained on Gender Budgeting. MWCD has prepared 2 practitioners' handbooks on GB (2009 and 2015) to support trainers on GB in English and Hindi. MWCD has empaneled and prepared an exhaustive list of resource persons on GB, which will be revised this year based on location and sectoral expertise.

c. Challenges faced

- 8. Some of the challenges are highlighted below:
 - Lack of gender disaggregated data Gender disaggregated data is an important prerequisite for planning and budgeting for different target groups. The lack of gender disaggregated data hence hampers the process of budgeting for women.
 - ➤ Inadequate financing towards GB by Ministries/Departments and State Governments With several Central Ministries/Departments stating to be "Gender Neutral", there is a need to ensure to gender mainstreaming in every Ministry/Department. These ministries need to design new program for women. Although our budgets are increasing, but proportionate budgetary increase for women is yet to be seen.
 - ➤ Gender based impact analysis, beneficiary needs assessment to identify scope for reprioritization of public expenditure and improve implementation, which is the mandate of GBCs constituted in different ministries have not achieved its intended momentum so far.

- Probably, this is due to the lack of dedicated human resources to implement the interventions identified by the GBCs. Monitoring remains one of the weakest links in the GRB work.
- Most State and National level policies do not highlight budgetary allocations – although National and State level policies focus on women empowerment, they do not set budget allocations for women.
- ➤ Lack of adequate communication with Central and State Governments Without proper communication with key officials especially in State Governments, the process of GB gets delayed, as it is very difficult to understand whom to reach out to.
- Assumptions behind reporting allocations under Part B of GB statement remain questionable.

In the end ,I would like to say that there is a need to shift from mere "reporting" of gender allocations to "purposive planning" with wide participation of women.

Annexure IV: Key Asks for the Union Budget 2020-21

Gender Transformative Policy and Financing: Key Asks for the Union Budget 2020-21



Feminist Policy Collective

December 2019

(The Feminist Policy Collective is an independent network of academic researchers, policy experts, and campaigners who are committed to strengthening gender transformative policies, plans, and budgets in India.)

Gender Transformative Policy and Financing: Key Asks for the Union Budget 2020-21

The Feminist Policy Collective convened a Consultation in the context of Union Budget 2020-21. The National Consultation, 'Deepening Voice & Visibility for Women's Rights and Gender Equality', held on 18 November, 2019 at the India Habitat Centre, New Delhi, discussed the persistent challenges at national and state level and also identified promising practices that can be replicated and strengthened through provisioning of resources in the upcoming Budget.

As gender equality and women's empowerment is a product of many inter-related elements, policy and budgetary measures in this regard need to be formulated with a multi-sectoral and multi-pronged approach. Following are the Key Policy and Budget Asks that emerged from the Consultation for the 2020-21 Budget.

Theme	Policy and Budget Asks	Concerned Ministry
Cross-Sectoral Measures	 Conduct a participatory gender situational analysis across various sectors with the involvement of CSOs and CBOs. Improve data systems to provide accurate and real-time gender disaggregated data, from all ministries/departments reporting in the Gender Budget Statements (GBS), at the national and state level. Calculate HDI for Dalit, de-notified tribes and Adivasi women in order to understand their socio-economic deprivation relative to overall HDI. Include all 17 SDGs in the national SDG framework along with gender specific indicators and periodically report on them. Provide adequate budget for the process of Gender Responsive Budgeting (GRB) at the national and subnational levels. Allocate adequate resources for gender sensitisation and capacity building of government officials at all levels across sectors, to improve gender responsiveness of programming, budgeting and implementation of government interventions. Finance Commission recommendations on devolutions to State Governments and resources of Local Governments need to promote gender transformative financing at all levels of the federal fiscal set up. 	 Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation Ministry of Finance

Economic Empowerment

- Enhance women's voices in the institutions and processes relating to formulation of economic and social policies.
- Increase access to credit for women's Self-Help Groups along with increased quantum of credit given under MUDRA loans. Support women to have sustainable businesses; enhance scope and reach to include single women, differently-abled women, and women belonging to backward castes.
- Strengthengovernment interventions towards increasing women's ownership over assets and resources such as land, water, forests, etc. Public land distribution programmes need to be initiated and adequate budgets need to be allocated for the same.
- Monitor the implementation of the Hindu Succession Act, 1956 and other succession laws to assess the status of women's ownership to inherited property.
- Increase public spending on schemes like *MGNREGA* that have higher participation of women, SCs and STs.
- Provide separate job cards to women so that they may be recognised as workers in their own right.
- Increase the number of days of employment under MGNREGA to 200 days per year for women as employment of rural women is declining at a steady rate. Social Audit mechanisms to monitor efficiency of the programme need to be financed in every State.
- Ensure timely dispensation of wages under MGNREGA to strengthen the programme given it serves a large section of rural women.
- Remove Hindu Undivided Family as a tax filing entity, entailing women to be identified as independent fiscal agents.
- Provide women entrepreneurs' and women with microenterprises easy access to technology.
- Review if *Digital India* has been successful in increasing women's use of smartphones and tablets for increasing access to opportunities, markets for jobs and products, and access to finance.
- Exempt women's economic collectives from stamp duty.
- Reduce stamp duty and property taxes on property

- Ministry of Finance
- Ministry of Rural Development
- Ministry of Electronics & Information Technology
- Ministry of Skill
 Development and
 Entrepreneurship
- Ministry of Petroleum & Natural Gas
- Ministry of Women and Child Development
- Ministry of Law and Justice

	ownership for women.	
	Provide tax rebates for employed women.	
	Increase presence of women bankers in rural areas.	
	 Ensure forward and backward linkages for skilling and entrepreneurship programmes to encourage participation of women. 	
	 Move skilling programmes beyond traditional occupations such as tailoring and working in beauty parlours into more technology-focussed programmes. 	
	 Institute policy to protect women working as domestic help in households from sexual abuse, harassment and violence; ensure payment of minimum wage and access to social security for them. 	
	Under the GBS, report schemes like <i>Pradhan MantriJeevanJyotiBimaYojana</i> and <i>Pradhan Mantri Suraksha BimaYojana</i> aimed at financial inclusion of unorganised workers including domestic workers between the ages of 18-50 years.	
	 Expand the scope of <i>UjjwalaYojana</i> beyond the first cylinder to ensure sustainability of women's usage of LPG. 	
	 Invest in crèches and early child-care centres to ensure more time for women to engage in activities outside household. 	
Food Security and Nutrition	Prioritise food provision for those under the poverty line and those with chronic illnesses like TB and AIDS, especially women and women headed households.	Ministry of FinanceMinistry of
	 Reduce GST on essential food items, such as pulses and grains. 	Consumer Affairs, Food & Public
	 Diversify food crops in the PDS to include millets and other food crops by linking it with homestead and subsistence farming that women are engaged in. 	Distribution
Rural	Make Mahila Gram Sabhas mandatory.	Ministry of Rural
Development	 Prioritise extension of Pradhan MantriAwasYojana to single women; facilitate the process of getting land in the name of the women for housing. 	DevelopmentMinistry of Panchayati Raj
	Provide loans to marginalised women at zero interest rate.	
	In the context of National Rural Livelihoods Mission	

	(NRLM) and State Missions, prioritise support to women farmers and provide loans at zero interest rate.	
Transportation	 Set up surveillance mechanisms for women's safety in Railway and other public transportation systems. Introduce women's safety audits. Remove charges at waiting rooms in railway stations. Increase women only buses and bus-stops. Increase number of women and transgender persons employed in transportation, security, and as non-teaching staff in schools. Use Nirbhaya funds to make gender friendly public places including railway stations, ports and labour nakas. 	 Ministry of Railways Ministry of Road Transport and Highways Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs Ministry of Labour and Employment Ministry of Finance
Health	 Increase maternity benefits from Rs. 5,000 to Rs. 18,000 (Tamil Nadu is providing Rs 18,000 now and women's rights activists there are aspiring to get this increased further to Rs. 25,000). Extend the <i>Pradhan MantriMatruVandanaYojna (PMMVY)</i> to provide maternity benefit for more than one child. Extend Maternity Benefit Act to include women workers in the informal sector. Match <i>Anganwadi Centres'</i> timings with work timings to enable women to access quality child care while on the job. Monitor the spending and the outcomes of <i>Rashtriya Kishore Swasthya Programme</i> and all other adolescents' health and nutrition programmes. 	 Ministry of Health and Family Welfare Ministry of Women and Child Development
Education	 Make access to scholarships easier for girls in rural areas by allowing offline applications in addition to the current online mode. Increase the number of post-matric scholarships, targeting underprivileged women, particularly from Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes communities. Provide resources towards creation of a gender-aware society through mass campaigns and introducing gender sensitivity and comprehensive sexuality education in schools. 	 Ministry of Human Resource Development Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment Ministry of Minority Affairs Ministry of Tribal

		AffairsMinistry of Information and Broadcasting
Agriculture	 Delink land ownership from recognition of individuals as 'farmers', in order to ensure recognition of women farmers; prioritise registration of women farmers using National Agriculture Policy (Karnataka has initiated the FRUITS portal). Recognize women as farmers and facilitate access for them to the income guarantee scheme of Rs. 6000 per annum under the <i>Pradhan MantriKisanSammanNidhiYojana</i>. Develop and disseminate technologies that are climate-friendly and will reduce the burden of labour on women farmers. Provide equipment such as, trolleys to make carrying water easier. Increase accessibility for women to Minimum Support Price scheme by placing procurement agencies closer to 	Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers' Welfare
Irrigation	 Improve women's and trans people's access to water for protective irrigation irrespective of land holding. Extend benefits under the PMKSY (<i>Pradhan MantriKrishiSinchaiYojna</i>) to women farmers and their collectives Ensure participation of women on all water committees and allocate budgets to ensure they participate in the decision making processes. 	 Ministry of Jal Shakti Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers' Welfare
Water and Sanitation	 Develop WASH policy in consultation with various stakeholders, that addresses the key gender issues and create an operational plan to implement the policy. Invest in capacity building programmes for supporting women making informed choices as lack of informed participation by women often results in WASH services that are inappropriate, inaccessible and unaffordable. Ensure access to separate, functional toilets for girls and boys in schools; ensure access to sanitary pads for girls and 	 Ministry of Jal Shakti Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation

their environmentally-friendly disposal. Design and implement campaigns that shift the narrative of women as caretakers in WASH related work. Improve provisioning of water supply for drinking and other uses. Provide sex-disaggregated data on impact of WASH schemes across Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. Allocate adequate budget for prevention of sexual assault Ministry of Women Safety and on girls, women and transgender people through positive and Child Security measures like making public spaces safe for them through Development provision of facilities so that they are less vulnerable – Ministry of Housing public toilets, street lighting, safe public spaces, housing, and Urban Affairs hostels etc. Ministry of Road Allocate adequate budget for compensating women who Transport and are victims or survivors of sexual assault. This should be **Highways** done at different levels – immediate compensation for her Ministry of Jal to be able to deal with the assault, counseling and shelter Shakti facilities for her to mentally and emotionally deal with the trauma, facilities for education and training and Ministry of Health employment opportunities for her to get on with her life. and Family Welfare Ensure support from Nirbhaya funds so that one-stop-• Ministry of Home centres (Sakhi centres) are set up and operational in all **Affairs** districts across the country Ministry of Law Provide details in GBS on money used in prevention of and Justice violence and safety of women under the NirbhayaFund. Ministry of Finance Provide shelter homes at the Block level to improve access, and make it more accessible to all gender non-conforming individuals. Ensure effective utilisation of NirbhayaFund for setting up special police helplines for women, designing safe public transport and providing quick redressal mechanisms. Make an assessment of human and monetary resources required for ensuring women's safety including effective policing, fast-track courts, and effective implementation of schemes for women's safety; allocate resources and make a time-bound plan for its roll-out. Provide details in GBS on the implementation of the Rape Compensation Scheme.

Social Justice and	 Provide full time Protection Officers and designate service providers for meaningful implementation of the Protection of Women from Domestic Violence Act, 2005. Report schemes for transgender persons under the GBS to 	Ministry of Social
Empowerment	 move away from a binary policy framework. Include a gender component in Scheduled Caste Sub Plan(SCSP) and Tribal Sub-Plan (TSP) guidelines, plans and reports. Provide alternative employment to women working as manual scavengers. Institute assistance scheme for non-widowed single women (Rajasthan and Andhra Pradesh have this). Increase the unit cost under the <i>Indira Gandhi National Widow Pension</i> scheme to Rs. 3,000. Ensure access to social security for retired sex-workers. 	Justice and Empowerment Ministry of Finance Ministry of Women and Child Development
Monitoring and Accountability	 Provide a rationale and objective behind each scheme, programme and institution reported in the GBS and ensure that the monitoring focuses on the expected outcomes of the scheme/ programme. Track expenditure across schemes and ministries and identify causes for low spending/ utilisation. Involve centres for women's studies and research organizations in developing and testing appropriate indicators to strengthen gender analysis, as well as in monitoring and evaluating the implementation of the SDG goals. Create a task force for continuous capacity building and taking the process of GRB forward; create a technical group to hand-hold organisations in states for GRB. Expand the scope of monitoring beyond quantitative indicators to include qualitative feedback from the 'affected groups'/ 'beneficiaries' on the ground, by using a participatory process. Begin implementation of gender audits as part of the mainstream audit processes, accompanied by strict measures for non-compliance (as is being followed in the Philippines). 	 Ministry of Finance Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation Ministry of Human Resource Development Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pensions